

HACU 241
FALL 2009

PEER REVIEW

Consult your partner's **DRAFT QUESTIONNAIRE** and pay attention to the aspects of the draft about which your partner wants specific feedback. Read the draft two times, making comments in the margins. The following questions should guide your reading:

1. ARGUMENT:
 - What argument is your partner making? Is this claim narrow enough? Can it be supported using the chosen texts? If no argument is clearly articulated, where does the essay's center of gravity seem to lie? Underline what you consider to be the essay's thesis statement.
 - What analytical and conceptual terms are important to the essay? Are these key terms clearly defined?
2. ORGANIZATION:
 - Does the existing introduction set up the paper well, or might a different kind of introduction work better?
 - Does the essay have different sections, and are there clear transitions between them?
 - Does the end of the essay conclude the argument satisfactorily and address the implications of the argument? If the conclusion has not been written yet, what implications could be addressed in the conclusion?
3. USE OF EVIDENCE/TEXTS:
 - Are the claims of the essay supported consistently with evidence? What are some places where the essay needs more support?
 - Can you distinguish the arguments made by different secondary sources?
 - Is it clear where the source material ends and the writer's analysis begins?
 - Does your partner engage with the texts, introducing and contextualizing them, rather than plugging in various quotes or paraphrases?
 - Has s/he cited the text correctly, and supplied a "works cited" list at the end of the paper?
4. STRENGTHS AND WEAKNESSES
 - What do you consider to be this draft's greatest (and best-supported) insight?
 - What ideas in this essay need to be thought through more critically?
 - Where might your partner start his/her revision?

LETTER TO PARTNER: After you have read the essay twice and have written marginal comments, write a letter to your partner. This letter should be about a page long, single-spaced. In this letter, try to restate the essay's argument in your own words, then explain what you perceive to be the essay's strengths and weaknesses, ending with *specific suggestions* for how your partner might begin revising the essay. Make sure to respond to the areas of concern that your partner indicated in his/her **QUESTIONNAIRE**.

Bring both your **LETTER TO PARTNER** and your partner's **QUESTIONNAIRE** (as well as the marked-up draft) with you to the **lecture on Tuesday, Dec. 1**.

PLEASE EMAIL YOUR PARTNER AND ME IMMEDIATELY IF, FOR ANY REASON, YOU CANNOT COMPLETE THIS ASSIGNMENT AND/OR COME TO CLASS ON TUESDAY.